INTERNATIONAL LABOUR OFFICE

Recent Trends in Women's Work in Italy

Reprinted from the
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR REVIEW
Vol. LXXXI, No. 4, April 1960

GENEVA, 1960

Recent Trends in Women's Work in Italy

by

Franco ARCHIBUGI

The evolution of women's employment in Italy since the end of the nineteenth century has followed a somewhat similar course in certain respects to that in most industrialised countries.[1] *In others it has differed greatly, mainly because of economic, demographic and ideological factors peculiar to the Italian peninsula. In the following article Professor Archibugi, of the School of Higher Labour Studies at the University of Florence, investigates the causes of these striking differences and concludes that, under the influence of changing attitudes, women's employment in Italy may well be at a turning point.*

Wage Earning and Women's Work

WOMEN'S work unquestionably arouses greater interest today than at any other time in the past. But this interest is confined to the particular form of work that has become predominant in modern society, namely wage-earning employment.[2] In other words it is focused on the female " labour market " [3], i.e. on women who are willing to work for others for a wage.

Moreover, the close identification of " women's work " with " female wage-earning employment " is to a large extent justified by the fact that it was only with the growth of the latter that women started to work outside the home to any considerable extent and the problems with which we are concerned here began to make themselves felt. As long as the dominant forms of labour

[1] Among recent articles on this subject published in the *International Labour Review*, see " Women's Wages ", Vol. LXXXI, No. 2, Feb. 1960 and " Women in the Labour Force ", Vol. LXXVII, No. 3, Mar. 1958.

[2] Naturally the term " wage " covers any form of contractual remuneration for any work solely involving the performance of services.

[3] The term " labour market " has been employed in this article because of its general use and also because it helps to distinguish work performed under contractual conditions from independent work—a distinction which is particularly necessary in the case of women's work.

relationships had a basis other than wage earning (e.g. slavery, serfdom, or handicrafts), women's work aroused no special interest either because, as in the case of serfdom, there were no appreciable differences between the conditions of work of the two sexes or because, as in the era of the guilds, women were virtually excluded from any but domestic activities.

It was after the Industrial Revolution and the social and economic changes which foreshadowed, accompanied and followed it that women came to work outside the home, to which they had been confined when society was dominated by the guilds. A genuine labour market only came into being with the Industrial Revolution. Indeed, so far as women were concerned the labour market emerged solely because of the availability of ample female labour, just as the offer of contractual employment came in the first place from those entrepreneurs who could usefully employ women. Only in these circumstances could wage earning supersede the craft system.

What we know of the wage-earning system throughout history shows that wherever it is highly developed there are large numbers of women on the labour market and that the proportion of employees is invariably higher among working women than among men. Even where the vast majority of economically active men are employees, the fact remains that the proportion of women in the total labour supply on the market tends to equal the proportion of men.[1]

The problem of women's work is therefore that of the female labour market. Nevertheless a knowledge of the general pattern of activity among the population, both male and female, is essential to understand and interpret the female labour market or employment in general. If the stage of development of the wage-earning system in relation to the persistence of other systems of employment, especially of corporative crafts, governs the growth of women's work outside the home, it follows conversely that in any country or environment women's work in general will faithfully reflect the evolution of wage-earning employment in that country or environment.

A study of trends in women's work in Italy bears out, both in general and in detail, the closeness of the relationship between women's employment and the stage of development of the society concerned. The evolution of the female labour market in Italy, which we shall examine in this article, has taken place under conditions (demographic, economic and sociological) which to some

[1] The occupational statistics of all the industrial western countries show the same feature.

extent are closely akin to those in the other industrial Western countries (conditions which may be said to be "typical" of the process of industrialisation) and to some extent are peculiar to the Italian environment. These latter conditions are mainly due to the order in which key developments in the industrialisation of Italy took place and are also governed by the political and institutional framework within which the process has occurred as well as by the contradictions it has produced because of the survival of social and economic features characteristic of the old, corporative, craft system.

The purpose of this article is therefore to distinguish what is *typical* from what is *specific* in the evolution of the female labour market in Italy. But in describing the characteristics of this evolution we shall also try to illustrate its nature and explain its causes.

The "Deproletarianisation" of Agriculture and Its Effects on Women's Work

As in most of the Western countries there is a small majority of women in the population of working age (15-64 years)—a majority which demographic forces are tending to increase slightly as time goes by, at least judging by the experience of the past 50 years.[1]

Women, however, represent only a small part of the total economically active population. In the 1901 census the active female population accounted for 32 per cent. of the total female population and by 1951 this proportion had fallen to 25 per cent. following a steady decline over the whole of the half century. As is well known the measurement of the economically active population can lead to confusion and misunderstanding unless it is backed up by careful analysis of the actual nature of these activities.[2] Nevertheless it is not difficult to single out with reasonable accuracy the phenomena which have affected the Italian census figures over the past half century.

[1] In the last decades of the nineteenth century men were slightly in the majority. At the beginning of the present century, however, women moved into the lead and have been steadily gaining proportionately ever since.

[2] In the Italian censuses, the results of which are usually compared, the definitions used in calculating the "active population" have in fact changed. And even if the criteria employed had remained constant, they would still afford ample scope for error in determining the existence of economic activities. This also makes any international comparisons of active population particularly hazardous even if the increasingly standardised modern classifications are used.

During these 50 years the proportion of the total active population (men and women) has not fallen off appreciably.[1] Over the whole period the Italian population increased by about 14 per cent. and the active population by 12 per cent. The active male population maintained a fairly constant ratio to the total male population over this period and it was only in the ratio between the number of economically active women and the total number of women that there was any marked fall (as mentioned earlier).[2]

In fact an absolute fall only occurred in agriculture, whereas in the other branches of the economy there was actually an increase, which, however, was in proportion neither to the fall in the numbers employed in agriculture [3] nor, obviously, to the general increase in the population of Italy or in the active population which resulted.[4]

It should be noted that the fall in the number of women in agriculture accounts for nearly four-fifths of the total decrease of manpower in agriculture. On the other hand it must be borne in mind that the changes in agriculture have been so far-reaching that without an exact knowledge of them it is impossible to place an accurate interpretation on this heavy decrease (especially since nothing similar happened to the male agricultural labour force). Moreover it should not be forgotten that in Italy, side by side with the general process of industrialisation, there has been a tendency towards the " deproletarianisation " of the peasants. Between 1911 and 1936 the number of agricultural wage earners fell from 54 to 28 per cent. of the total number engaged in agriculture ; simultaneously over the same period the numbers of self-employed persons in agriculture increased. The proportion of persons farming their own land rose from 18 to 33 per cent., that of persons farming land belonging to other people (tenants, etc.) from 9 to 19 per cent.,

[1] Official Italian statistics define as the " active population " persons aged 10 and over engaged in an occupation, craft or trade ; the " non-active population " is defined as persons of any age who are not gainfully employed, persons under the age of 10 and persons aged 10 and above whose occupation or status is unknown.

[2] In 1901, out of an economically active population of 16 million, over 5 million were women. In 1951 the total active population was nearly 20 million but the number of active women had fallen in absolute terms by 236,000, equivalent to 4.5 per cent. of their total number in 1901. See F. ARCHIBUGI: " Alcune fonti statistiche per la conoscenza dell'evoluzione del mercato del lavoro femminile in Italia ", in *Politica Sindacale* (Rome), Year II, No. 4, Aug. 1959, pp. 381-412.

[3] The number of economically active women fell by 1,087,000 in agriculture and increased by 148,000 in industry, 294,000 in commerce and services and 409,000 in public services—giving a net fall of 236,000 units.

[4] The population over these 50 years increased by about 4 million and the active population by 3,700,000.

and that of share farmers from 19 to 20 per cent.[1] This development is mainly due to land reform and above all to the purchase or lease of land by peasants who previously had only worked for hire.[2]

It can be assumed that the womenfolk of these farm families (and particularly the wives and mothers), who were formerly wage earners and later became independent, account for the substantial fall in the *apparent* proportion of economically active women in agriculture since " housewives ", even in share-farming families, are not classified as active in the census.

Naturally the key factor is still the inability of the non-agricultural branches of the economy to absorb redundant female agricultural labour ; but while it would appear that this factor can explain the relative fall in the female active population, the " deproletarianisation " of agriculture and its effect on the census figures is the only way of explaining the absolute fall in the number of women shown in the census as economically active in agriculture —a fall which has not occurred among the men except to a very slight extent.[3]

Nor have the women set free from agriculture been absorbed by other forms of activity at a higher rate than the men. On the contrary, with the exception of public administration, there has everywhere been a greater absorption of men than of women in the non-agricultural sectors in relation to the additional labour force created by the increase in the population.

This phenomenon which is the most distinctive feature of women's work in Italy as compared with other countries calls for further analysis. But before reviewing the economic and social

---

[1] In absolute terms the number of independent farmers increased by about 1 million between 1911 and 1936, tenants by over half a million, while the number of share farmers remained much the same. Over the same period the number of agricultural wage earners fell by 1½ million. These figures, which are taken from the census, are quoted by M. BANDINI : *Cento anni di storia agraria italiana* (Rome, 1957).

[2] The increase in the number of smallholders, which has been the salient feature of this process, began during the First World War and continued up to about 1930 ; this is a factor of major importance for Italy even though it may have hampered the growth of industry and the rationalisation of farming itself. The purchases of land—which have inflated land prices—were mainly made with profits earned during the war and with remittances from emigrants. Since the Second World War there has been a further spontaneous tendency for the number of smallholdings to increase. An important influence has also been exercised by the Government's redistribution of uncultivated land and big estates, especially after the First World War, but after the Second World War as well.

[3] For the period between 1901 and 1951, 1,087,000 women as against 162,000 men. Obvious as it is, this phenomenon appears to have been overlooked by all those who have hitherto tried to explain the absolute fall in the Italian female active population as shown by the censuses.

conditions affecting trends on the female labour market it should be pointed out that, as in the other western countries, the Italian active female population (regardless of its quantitative evolution) has a lower average age than the male active population ; in addition a relatively greater majority of women workers than of men are employees, only a very small minority being independent workers.[1] These last two characteristics are so typical of the active female population in all the countries of the western world that their interest in individual cases lies in their background and intensity.

Obstacles to the Entry of Women into Non-Agricultural Employment

As we have seen the " deproletarianisation " of agriculture is responsible for the absolute fall in the active female population over the past 50 years. This explanation amply confirms the rule noted in the first section—that the employment of women outside the home is closely bound up with the development of the wage-earning system. In Italian agriculture over the past half century wage earning has to some extent been in regression. The purchase or lease of land by wage-earning or share-farming peasants has marked a shift from the wage-earning system in agriculture (which plays a very important part in Italy) back to the craft system.[2] This has led to a decline in female labour and a return to the system of family employment, at least in the countryside.[3]

[1] In 1951 for every 100 men in the active population as a whole there were 33.5 women. But in the 10-14 age group there were 54.4, in the 14-18 age group there were 50, and in the 18-21 age group there were 48.4. In the 22-25 age group there were 42.3, and so on until the 65-and-over age group, in which there were only 19.7 women for every 100 men. Moreover, while the majority of active men (54 per cent.) were over 35 the majority of active women (56 per cent.) were under that age.

Also in 1951 taking the male labour force as a whole 67 per cent. were employees and 33 per cent. were " independent ", while among women workers 84 per cent. were employees and only 16 per cent. were " independent ". The position was the same in manufacturing : 19.7 per cent. of male workers and 8.7 per cent. of female workers were independent, while in commerce and services 58.8 per cent. of male workers and only 29 per cent. of female workers were independent. See " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., tables 10 and 11.

[2] The term " craft system " is of course intended to cover any form of self-employed activity including farming.

[3] The wage-earning class in Italian agriculture, particularly those members of it who have become smallholders or tenants, was not the product of a corporative craft system that had disintegrated under the impact of capitalist concerns and the free market as happened in industry. This class was rather the product of an older system which lingered on in rural areas in all European countries, namely serfdom. Italian agricultural wage earners, most of whom are seasonal workers and represent a pre-capitalist form of employment, were (and still are, except in the restricted area in which capitalist enterprise has developed) the heirs of the serfs on the big estates rather than

But the frequently noted relative fall in the Italian female active population has been accompanied by only a slight expansion in the non-agricultural labour market. All the available quantitative analyses show that female employment in industry and tertiary activities, while it has increased in absolute terms, has not expanded over the last few decades at the same rate as male employment.[1] In some cases female employment has increased by more (or fallen by less) than male employment but in most it has increased by less (or fallen by more). The difference in the rate of increase (or fall) in female and male employment may be large or small, significant or unimportant, depending on the industry or activity concerned. But by and large in Italy gainful employment for women has not been expanding as fast as for men.

This tendency has continued in recent years although less obtrusively.[2] In the typical wage-earning sectors, however, it is even more in evidence.[3]

---

the product of a genuine market for farm labour. Hence the extension of landowning has given rise to the great variety of agricultural " contracts " which are a feature of Italian society and (owing to the rapid growth of the population) has weakened the link between the worker and the land ; this in turn has led to the formation of a rural sub-proletariat which is also a feature of Italian society. The progress of the craft system in Italian agriculture has not been at the expense of capitalist ownership but at the expense of large-scale pre-capitalist land-ownership. The over-all effect has also been to reduce the extent of the agricultural labour market.

[1] Women accounted for 32.4 per cent. of the actively employed population in industry in 1901 and for 21.9 in 1951. In commerce and services the corresponding percentages were 33.3 and 28.6 and in public administration 21.9 and 32.4. Comparing the number of persons employed in industry and commerce as shown by the industrial and commercial censuses of 1937-39 and 1951, we find that, whereas in 1937-39 there were 28.5 women for every 100 persons in these two sectors taken together, in 1951 there were only 27.6 despite an over-all increase in employment of about 10 per cent. See " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., tables 9 and 12, and paragraphs 4 and 5.

[2] For example according to special sample surveys made in the four-year period 1954-57 the proportion of women in the total labour force increased from 23.5 per cent. in 1954 to 25 per cent. in 1957 ; thus there has been a slight relative increase. But it should not be deduced that there has been a more marked trend for women to enter the labour market. Extracting from the same statistics the figures regarding employees we find that the proportion of women to the total fell in only four years from 23.4 per cent. in 1954 to 22.7 per cent. in 1957. In industry the proportion of women employees fell over the same period from 21.6 to 20.6 per cent. ; in tertiary activities as a whole the drop was from 32.5 to 28.9 per cent. The tendency for wage-earning employment to increase, shown by the available employment figures for recent years, is therefore more marked among men than among women both in all activities taken together and in industry and tertiary activities ; only among agricultural wage earners is there a more marked fall among men than among women. See " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., tables 13, 14 and 19, paragraphs 6 and 9.

[3] In " large-scale " industry, in which employment is reckoned on the basis of returns to the Ministry of Labour, women accounted for 34.7 per cent. of total employment in 1951 and for only 30.5 per cent. in 1958 despite

An accurate yardstick of this phenomenon is provided by the substitution ratio of male and female labour which is apparent from a study of comparable statistics over a specified length of time. This ratio is based on the proportion of female labour compared with male labour at the beginning of the period in question and an estimate of what female employment should have been at the end of the period in order to maintain the initial ratio.

In Italy throughout the entire period for which statistics are available the substitution ratio in respect of female labour has been consistently negative.

Let us take, for example, the variations in the structure of employment in industry and commerce between the two censuses of 1937-39 and 1951. There was an over-all increase in the number of female workers of 127,000. But if the 1937-39 proportion between women and all workers in all branches of industry and commerce had been maintained the total increase in female employment should have been 152,000. It can therefore be stated that between the pre-war and post-war periods (1937-1951) men replaced women in 25,000 jobs in industry and commerce. The substitution ratio is minimal (0.3 per cent of total male and female employment). But it is noticeably higher (2.3 per cent.) for the " female " sectors as a whole (i.e. those sectors which in 1937-39 employed a higher proportion of women than the average for the whole of industry and commerce) ; in these sectors the jobs lost by women number more than 60,000, whereas women have taken over about 35,000 jobs in the " male " sectors. The employment of women has also become more widespread in industry and commerce, but this has not taken place on a sufficient scale to lead to a proportionate increase in the number of women workers. We shall deal with this in more detail in the following section.

There are grounds for assuming that this tendency is typical of the Italian labour market and is not encountered in the larger western industrial countries, where the substitution ratio is rather in favour of women.[1]

---

an over-all increase of 3.5 per cent. in employment in the establishments covered. Similarly on the books of the National Sickness Insurance Institute (whose statistics are a fairly significant guide to the over-all trend in wage-earning employment) there were 48.4 women for every 100 men in 1951 and 42.5 in 1956 ; in industry the figures were 37.7 women for every 100 men in 1951 and only 42.6 in 1956 ; in commerce the fall was from 53.9 to 42.6 and in banking from 19.4 to 19.2. Thus, even in recent years there has unquestionably been a definite proportionate fall in the number of women in non-agricultural wage-earning employment in Italy. For further information on sources see " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., tables 15 and 16, and paragraph 7.

[1] For a discussion of the general conditions which, in the present state of the labour market, would encourage a substitution ratio favourable to female labour see F. ARCHIBUGI : *L'Economia del lavoro femminile* (Milan, 1958).

There are three main reasons for this : *(a)* the limited progress of industrialisation and of the wage system in industry and tertiary activities in general, which has curtailed over-all demand for female labour in these sectors ; *(b)* the chronic glut of labour, which creates constant pressure from the unemployed and a generally unfavourable climate for the employment of women ; and *(c)* ideological factors, which are especially important in Italy, where there is hostility to the employment of women away from the home and to the wage system in general. Naturally these three main reasons, together with various other secondary factors, are very closely bound up together; the limited development (in a capitalist sense) of industry and tertiary activities is not only a cause but also to some extent an effect of the widespread unemployment and underemployment which has always depressed the Italian consumer market and hampered the growth of the services catering for it.

The ideological factors mentioned are largely a result of the circumstances in which women are employed outside the home, namely a depressed labour market in which not only does the additional supply of female labour make things worse for the men but, owing to the low level of productivity and the limited availability of capital, women's employment does not entail sufficient financial advantages to offset the economic and social costs to the family. As we shall see later, this practical background to the employment of women is to a great extent responsible for the psychological resistance to the idea of extending their employment.

Let us, therefore, look at these three factors, bearing in mind their interdependence.

Limited Industrialisation and the Demand for Female Labour

As is well known, Italian industry is not very highly developed in relation to agriculture, and the tertiary sectors are even more underdeveloped.[1] But apart from this evidence of inadequate industrialisation (which is widely recognised) the way in which industrialisation has come about has also contributed to depress

[1] In 1958, 32.1 per cent. of the Italian labour force was employed in agriculture, 36.2 per cent. in industry and 31.7 per cent. in tertiary activities. As recently as 1954, on the other hand, 39.5 per cent. of the labour force was employed in agriculture, 32 per cent. in industry and 28 per cent. in tertiary activities. In recent years there has been an almost revolutionary change in the pattern of the labour force. The net product of these sectors of the economy has also undergone impressive changes. In agriculture it fell from 27 per cent. of the total in 1951 to 20.6 per cent. in 1957 ; while in industry it increased from 40.1 to 40.8 per cent. ; in services from 23.1 to 26.9 per cent. and in public administration from 9.6 to 11.7 per cent. Despite the progress made in recent years towards " de-ruralisation " of the

female employment. Italian industry developed under the influence of two decisive conditions—a scarcity of capital and an abundance of labour. These conditions encouraged the development of industries requiring little capital and ample labour and in each industry they favoured a combination of the least capital-intensive and the most labour-intensive methods possible. The resulting low labour productivity has always been offset partly by a policy of low wages and partly by a heavily protectionist system, which between them have helped to discourage capital-intensive production methods.

Looking back over an era full of technical change and in the light of the experience it has provided we can state that, with the sole exception of the textile industry, the demand for female labour depends upon the rate of capital investment. Save in the textile industry, which as the pioneer industry in the Industrial Revolution constitutes a case apart, it can confidently be asserted that employment opportunities for women in industry increase in step with the growth of mechanisation and the breaking down of traditional manual operations in which it results. Women have managed to enter occupations traditionally closed to them only in undertakings using production methods based mainly on the machine and then only in the departments most affected by mechanisation. Hitherto the machine has usually been more detrimental to men's than to women's employment.

Since mechanisation appeared relatively later and has made relatively less progress in Italy than in other industrial countries, and the production methods employed continue to be strongly influenced by the shortage of capital and the abundance of labour, the trend in industrial employment has not been particularly favourable to the employment of women.

An outstanding exception, as was stated earlier, is the textile industry, which is not very capital intensive compared with other industries but predominantly employs female labour. The introduction of mechanisation, the growth of the textile industry and the employment of women are so bound up together from the start that it is difficult to assign the real reasons for this phenomenon. But since the days of the earliest machines and factories there have not been many occupations apart from textiles in which a low degree of mechanisation has operated in favour of female labour.[1]

country (which some consider to be greater than the progress made in the whole of the first half of the century), Italy is still a country in which agriculture plays a preponderant part, since industry is not yet sufficiently developed and the tertiary occupations have the technical and managerial standards characteristic of an underdeveloped country.

[1] It is perhaps only in recent years, with the latest developments in automation, that there has been any risk of an enlargement of job content and a return to higher standards of skill which might be detrimental to the

As long as the textile industry dominated industry as a whole and therefore accounted for the largest share of industrial demand for labour, women occupied a leading position on the labour market. In Italy, where the textile industry has always been relatively more important than in the other industrial countries, women also played a relatively greater part on the industrial labour market at the start of the Industrial Revolution (which took place in Italy in the last decades of the nineteenth century). In 1880 women constituted a clear majority of the total labour force in Italian industry proper. In the early years of this century women still accounted for half the total number of industrial workers. It was the decline of the textile industry, coupled with inadequate mechanisation in the other industries and the slow general progress of industrialisation, which created a pattern of industrial demand for labour which was generally unfavourable to women.[1] In the tertiary sectors demand for female labour has largely been governed by the limited growth of services. As in all countries, women find the widest scope for employment in tertiary occupations, and this lack of development has played a large part in restricting the entry of women into the labour market in Italy. But the lines along which

employment of women. But it is impossible to be dogmatic on this point because of lack of experience and of any accurate yardstick for deciding whether the foreseeable loss of female employment through automation will be due to the technical characteristics of automation itself or to the inadequate skills of the women workers. From many points of view, however, automation should have a favourable effect upon female employment, especially as regards hours of work, job determination and methods of payment, apart from the fact that automation might stimulate expansion in the tertiary sectors.

[1] Between 1937 and 1951 the industries in which employment increased the most were : rubber (increase of 62.9 per cent.), engineering (61.3 per cent.), iron and steel (40.0 per cent.), chemicals (29.9 per cent.) and paper (18.5 per cent.). But the proportion of women in these industries fell over the same period from 51.3 per cent. to 34.7 per cent. in rubber, from 13.0 to 12.1 per cent. in engineering and from 47.2 to 39.6 per cent. in paper ; on the other hand, it increased from 3.7 per cent. to 6.9 per cent. in iron and steel (in which, however, there are very few women workers) and from 26.0 to 27.9 per cent. in chemicals. Generally speaking, therefore, the growth of industry in Italy during these years has not favoured the employment of women. Moreover, in some major industries in which employment has remained virtually static the proportion of women has not increased ; for example in textiles total employment has increased since before the war by almost 7.9 per cent. but the proportion of women has fallen from 75.2 to 71.7 per cent. ; in tobacco employment has risen by 7.6 per cent., while the proportion of women has fallen from 85.9 per cent. to 78.5 per cent ; in the processing of non-metallic minerals employment has remained level but the proportion of women has likewise fallen from 17.4 to 16.8 per cent. of the total. In garment-making, in which there has been a fall in employment of 11.2 per cent., and in printing, in which employment has fallen by 10.1 per cent., the proportion of women has remained stationary. Thus, even in industries with static or declining employment women have not improved their position. (For further details see " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., paragraph 5, table 12.)

the tertiary occupations have grown up in Italy have proved to constitute a further limiting factor. As in many countries whose industry has only developed late, a genuine wage system has not been established in the tertiary sector in Italy; for although it has perhaps expanded in the last few decades even faster than might have been expected from the general degree of industrialisation it has been swollen by self-employed persons who have drifted in from agriculture and set up in business in the towns as shopkeepers, middle men or providers of personal services, thus creating jobs which were not otherwise available on the normal agricultural or industrial labour market. Apart from the remarkable expansion of public administration, the development of the tertiary sector in Italy has taken the form of self-employment, and this has not created adequate opportunities for women, as was stated earlier. Naturally " capitalist " business has been spreading to the commercial sector as well, especially since the war, but not at the same rate as in other industrial countries ; and even here the demand for female labour has suffered a relative setback.[1]

The demand for labour in public administration is a special case. As this is an " official " labour market, it has been affected by ideological and customary factors instead of by the free play of supply and demand. Although in Italy discrimination against the

[1] In the tertiary sectors in which employment expanded most between 1937 and 1951 the proportion of women has fallen. In hotels and catering and public services, for example, where total employment increased by 67 per cent. and a substantial increase in female employment could have been expected, the proportion of women was actually higher before the war (51.2 per cent.) than in 1951 (46.5 per cent.). In wholesaling, where there was an increase in employment of 42.6 per cent., the proportion of women fell from 22.1 per cent. to 21.6 per cent. The only tertiary occupations where employment increased and the proportion of women rose were those in which an insignificant number of women are employed, e.g. in banking, insurance and finance, where employment increased by 19 per cent. and in which women accounted for 15.4 per cent. in 1951 as against 10.9 per cent. before the war ; and in transport, where employment increased by 41.2 per cent. and women accounted for 4.6 per cent. as against 2.4 per cent. Communications were the only industry in which there was a substantial expansion (32 per cent.) and in which the proportion of women also rose (from 28 to 33.5 per cent.).

On the other hand, the proportion of women increased mainly in the tertiary sectors in which there had been a fall in over-all employment. For example in retailing (which fell by 2.6 per cent.) the proportion of women increased from 40.5 per cent. to 54.8 per cent. ; in miscellaneous services and recreation (entertainment, health and hygiene) the proportion of women increased from 18.3 to 23.6 per cent., despite the over-all decline in employment of 9.2 per cent. ; in auxiliary commercial activities the proportion of women increased from 9.4 to 12.6 per cent. despite a total fall of 12.6 per cent. It is likely that these particular tertiary sectors in which there has been a fall in employment are also those in which enough modernisation of management and techniques has been introduced to make it easier or advisable to employ women. (For further discussion, see " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit.)

employment of women has been legally abolished [1], in practice—as happens everywhere, though to a greater extent in Italy than in most other countries—women are excluded from certain important branches of public employment.[2]

In conclusion, it is clear that the changes in the structure of Italian society that are typical of a country progressing towards industrialisation, namely the expansion of the secondary and tertiary sectors compared with the primary sector, have not created the demand for female labour which should theoretically accompany them. In practice, behind the façade of shifts in employment from one sector to another, which are in fact quite appreciable, the inadequate growth of capital has limited the spread of the wage system and damped down the natural development of demand for female labour.[3]

---

[1] Legal discrimination preventing the entry of women into certain occupations is tending to disappear. Recently a branch of the police force was formed for women, and their participation in juries and juvenile courts gives grounds for assuming that they will one day be allowed to enter the ordinary magistrature, which is at present closed to them. Although legal obstacles are becoming less common, there are still some fairly serious barriers to the employment of women in occupations from which they have traditionally been excluded. For example the occupational classification laid down by the Central Institute of Statistics for the 1951 census contains some groups in which there are no women at all, e.g. " judicial officials ", " officers and non-commissioned officers of the armed forces of the State and officials of the police and security services ", " drivers of public transport vehicles, trams, etc.". Moreover, certain occupations classified under other headings are either *de jure* or *de facto* reserved for men—judges, diplomats, ships' engineers, harbour and airline pilots, deck officers, drivers of motor boats and launches and various other occupations.

[2] In public administration, according to a survey carried out in 1954, women accounted for 23.2 per cent. of the total numbers employed. But most of these were to be found in the teaching profession, where women accounted for 62 per cent. of those employed, while among civil servants the proportion of women is 18.6 per cent. and in the lower grades of wage earners it is only 12.7 per cent. (see " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., table 17).

[3] Even in recent years the demand for labour, especially in industry, has not been particularly favourable to women. Between 1951 and 1958 Italian industry proper, i.e. establishments employing more than ten persons, increased its labour force by 3.5 per cent. But the percentage of women in industry dropped from 34 in 1950 to 30 in 1958.

The only expanding industries in which the proportion of women rose were electrical engineering (from 33.7 per cent. to 37.3 per cent.), woodworking (from 24.5 to 28.8 per cent.) and chemicals and pharmaceuticals (from 23.2 to 24.3 per cent.). In the majority of developing industries the proportion of women has fallen, e.g. in confectionery, canning, footwear, printing, non-metallic minerals, engineering workshops, etc.

In the industries where employment is more or less stationary, e.g. paper, public works, motor cars, transport and iron and steel, the proportion of women has slightly declined. In the industries with a heavy fall in the level of employment the position tends to vary. In the technically most backward industries, e.g. footwear, cotton, wool, textiles in general, and milling, women have proportionately lost more ground than men, while in others, such as tanning and sugar, they have gained slightly.

(footnote continued overleaf)

Unemployment, Underemployment and the Female Labour Supply

The second of the factors that have hampered the entry of women into the labour market is, as we have seen, the endemic and chronic unemployment among Italian men. This glut of labour has always made it possible to employ workers at very low wage rates. Moreover, contrary to what happened in the other industrial countries, labour supply in industry and the tertiary activities has always grown far faster in Italy than demand.

Because of the abundance of cheap male labour Italian industry and many tertiary occupations have had no particular reason to draw on female labour as they have grown. Except in the early stages of the Industrial Revolution, when the employment of women was a somewhat special phenomenon which hardly constituted a threat to men, male and female labour have always competed, the dearer the one the greater being the demand for the other.

In Italy, with the exception of the textile industry, which, as we have seen, is a special case, the demand from industry was diverted from the female labour market mainly because of the convenient state of the male labour market. In some forms of tertiary activities this state of affairs is particularly evident; where in other countries the employment of women is customary—for example in all the tourist and catering trades—men still predominate in Italy.

It is sometimes argued that higher wage rates for men tend to contract the supply of female labour since the offer of labour, regardless of the worker's sex, is above all a demand for a " family " income. Although this assumption has been found to be outdated in many countries with full employment, where workers increasingly tend to offer their labour as individuals and demand an individual income, it certainly remains true of Italy, where, given the low level of men's wages and of family incomes, the supply of female labour permanently exceeds any possible growth of demand. Apart perhaps from the two war periods (and even then the shortage of male labour in Italy was markedly less acute than in any other of the industrial countries) there has never been in the history of Italian industry any labour shortage making it necessary to draw on female labour. It is only because of certain agreements and legislation protecting male workers (e.g. the statutory duty to pay family allowances) that there has been some expansion of female

Where the fall in total employment is due to a slump in the industry female employment appears to contract even more, while where it is due to technical progress the proportion of women is maintained and even improved. (See " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., table 16.)

employment owing to the " social charges " which add to the cost of male labour. Generally speaking, the replacement of men by women does not make economic sense in the present state of the Italian labour market.

Male wage rates, which have always tended to be kept down to the family subsistence level (as customarily accepted), only make it convenient to replace men by women at wage rates which hardly ever attract women to take jobs outside their homes.

Furthermore, the unbalance of the labour market, which has led to far-reaching government intervention in all aspects of labour relations and collective bargaining, also gives the authorities an almost permanent bias against female employment.

In practice the employment of women has always been discouraged by the authorities. First the protective measures introduced at the start of the century (long after the legislation passed in other industrial countries) give the impression of having been designed to discourage rather than protect the employment of women. In subsequent decades statutory measures followed at such a rate that few countries are as overloaded as Italy with enactments on the employment of women and that it is now one of the countries in which female labour involves the highest extra costs.[1] In the second place, the authorities ended by taking direct action to restrict the recruitment of women in relation to the recruitment of men, e.g. by an enactment of 1938, which had little effect only because of the outbreak soon after of the Second World War, but which is nevertheless an extremely significant pointer to the outlook of the authorities on this subject.[2]

But these aspects of government interference to discourage the employment of women so as to protect male employment in

[1] With the general and absolute prohibition of night work by women which came into force in 1906 and was strengthened by Italy's adherence to the 1906 Berne Convention, the textile industry in Italy, and particularly spinning, was harder hit than its counterpart in other countries. The spinning mills, which required large quantities of power, were dispersed all over Italy in regions where water power was available. With the abolition of night work the industry found that the capital it had invested in hydraulic power could only be used for half or less than half the 22 hours a day which had formerly been customary. This wiped out one of the main advantages which (along with the low wages paid) had helped the industry's development.

[2] This enactment was the Royal Legislative Decree of 5 September 1938 regulating the recruitment of women in public and private employment (i.e. excluding industry). This decree stated that not more than 10 per cent. of the employees in such establishments might be women and stipulated that public bodies and private concerns with fewer than ten employees could not employ any women at all. The decree did, however, allow some exceptions for " typically female " occupations. It also stated that any women employed in excess of the prescribed percentage must gradually be replaced by men over a period of three years.

view of the chronic unbalance of the labour market are better discussed in connection with the ideological resistance to the entry of women into the labour market, which has always been considerable in Italy.

Ideological Resistance to the Employment of Women

While the evolution of industry's demand for labour and the pattern of labour supply have automatically helped to keep women, whether single or married [1], young or old, off the labour market, the influence of a number of ideological factors must also be reckoned with. It is often very hard to decide how far ideas have influenced facts and how far facts have influenced ideas ; the case of the employment of women is a typical example of this, and we will therefore go no further than to say that in this case there has certainly been some interaction. So far, in discussing the effect of industrial demand and unemployment on women's work, we have been concerned by and large with the influence of the facts. We will now assume that the opposition to the employment of women is due partly to the overcrowded state of the Italian labour market and partly to the influence of certain ideological and cultural traditions which have little or no connection with the state of the labour market. This prejudice against the employment of women has had a very definite influence in Italy on the behaviour of employers, women workers themselves and their families, as well as on the behaviour of the trade unions and on legislation and administrative practice leading to the statutory protection and limitation of women's employment. Unquestionably this influence is more powerful in Italy than in any other western industrial country. These ideals taken as a whole can be considered under two headings : *(a)* the religious concept of woman's social position, and *(b)* population policy.

The Religious Concept of Women's Social Position

Religious attitudes towards woman's family and social duties, which profoundly changed with the growth of Christianity and the many social upheavals in the history of western Christendom, culminated during the last century in a clearly and precisely defined statement of policy by the Catholic church.

[1] There are no statistics from the census or labour force or industrial surveys showing the occupational breakdown of women in Italy by marital status. This is perhaps the biggest gap in the statistics relating to the employment of women.

This was a period in which the Catholic church began to show an interest in the " social " problem and what is commonly called " Catholic social doctrine " came into being.

The employment of women outside the home, only then beginning to emerge in Italy as a by-product of the extension of the wage system, was strongly deprecated by official Catholic thought. There were three reasons for this attitude.

First of all there was the influence of the conditions in which women had to work in Italy during the early days of the Industrial Revolution, i.e. the last decades of the nineteenth century. These conditions were in the main similar to those which were found in all countries that went through a spontaneous industrial revolution. But official Catholic thought, which was mainly voiced when these conditions occurred in the Catholic countries, paid little attention to the progress in the employment of women in other countries, where by the end of the last century general conditions of employment in industry had improved and protective legislation was beginning to produce an effect. Alarmed by the employment of women as wage earners, Catholics were not long in denouncing the harsh conditions in which women had to work, and in this they were in agreement with the radical and socialist schools of thought. In his encyclical *Rerum novarum* (1891) Pope Leo XIII stated :

> Women, again, are not suited to certain trades ; for a woman is by nature fitted for home work and it is that which is best adapted at once to preserve her modesty, and to promote the good bringing up of children and the well-being of the family.

But official Catholic opposition to wage-earning employment for women had still deeper origins.

Catholic social doctrine was erected as a bulwark for the defence of a craft and corporative society against the impact of an encroaching industrial and wage-earning society. Historically in the old society woman's place was in the home (both in the towns and in the villages) and production was based mainly on the family unit ; and even though, as industrial society evolved, Catholic social doctrine finally accepted the wage-earning system (while trying to temper it with various institutional devices such as associations and corporations, people's savings banks, opportunities for the people to set up on their own account and acquire property, etc.), it did not accept the consequences of the wage-earning system as they affected the family and women's work. In 1945 Pope Pius XII, in a speech to 1,500 Catholic women whom he received at the Vatican, stated very clearly the nature of the link between industrialisation and the employment of women outside the home :

Moreover, can woman expect to find her true well-being in a predominantly capitalist society ? We do not need to describe to you the economic and social consequences which ensue from this system. You are aware of its features and you yourselves bear its burden ; the crowding of people into the cities, the steady encroachment of large concerns, the difficult and precarious circumstances of the other industries, particularly of handicrafts and even more of agriculture . . . . Let us restore to its place of honour the mission of women and mothers in the home : this is the call to be heard on all sides like a cry of alarm, as if the world were frightened by the fruits of material and technical progress of which it was formerly so proud.

And in his encyclical *Quadragesimo anno* (1931) Pope Pius XI, referring to the employment of women, had explicitly stated :

Mothers, concentrating on household duties, should work primarily in the home or in its immediate vicinity. It is an intolerable abuse, and to be abolished at all costs, for mothers on account of the fathers' low wage to be forced to engage in gainful occupations outside the home to the neglect of their proper cares and duties, especially the training of children.

There was, indeed, and still is a third underlying influence shaping the attitude of official Catholic thought towards the employment of women (although its effect has now considerably diminished). This is the desire to safeguard the religious values of the family, marriage and the Christian marital relations as defined by the Catholic church.[1] It is feared that economic independence and the atmosphere of the workplace will have an effect on the moral, religious, cultural and civic behaviour of women that is not to be apprehended in the case of men. And it is thought that the education of the children, even in its modern form, will be more seriously harmed by the employment of their mother outside the home than by that of their father.[2]

[1] In his encyclical *Casti connubii* (1930) Pope Pius XI speaking of women's emancipation said of " social " emancipation, i.e. emancipation based on the employment of women outside the home : " Neither is this a true emancipation of woman, nor is it the reasonable and dignified liberty which is becoming to the noble and Christian duty of a woman and a wife ; rather is it a corruption of woman's nature and motherly dignity and a disruption of the whole family. . . . As soon as woman descends from the queenly position within the walls of her home to which she has been raised by the gospel she will at first relapse into her former servitude (if not outwardly, then certainly in fact) and, as in pagan times, will once more become a mere instrument of man." The same encyclical goes on to say : " If mothers of families, to the detriment of their households, are encumbered by the need and the burden of earning money by their own labour . . . it must be clear that they and their husbands are sure to suffer, their home life is sure to be made difficult and their observance of the Divine precepts will be impaired. . . ."

[2] Pope Pius XII in his 1945 speech, referred to earlier, painted the following picture of family life when a woman works outside her home : " Take the case of the woman who, in order to add to her husband's earnings, also goes out to work in a factory and leaves her home deserted while she is away . . . ; the members of the family work separately in the four corners of the city and with different working hours ; they are hardly ever alone whether to eat, to rest after the fatigue of the day or even less to pray

This religious dimension of social values is not directly affected by time and social change and, being the most ideological, is also the most stable feature of the Catholic attitude. However, even on this point, social change has made its influence felt in Italy. The clearest expression of this is to be found in the attitude and work of the "Italian Workers' Christian Associations" (A.C.L.I.). At a recent study conference on the employment of women organised by the A.C.L.I., the president, Mr. Penazzato, made a very balanced statement to the effect that—

> The outstanding feature of modern development is that it does not merely make limited demands on women's work but in fact calls upon them, as appropriate, to devote all their trained energies (depending on their individual abilities) in an effort to meet the general needs of the economy and maintain the highest rate of civic as well as economic development. There can be no doubt that the wider participation of women in economic life is an absolute necessity. Moreover a trend towards the wider employment of women has already begun even in our country and will inevitably develop along balanced and harmonious lines as part of the process of expansion which is the aim of our policy today.[1]

---

together. . . ." Later, speaking of the inevitable results, he said: "Apart from these harmful consequences brought about by the absence of the woman and the mother from the domestic hearth there is another even more deplorable result; this is the effect of this absence on the education of young girls and their preparation for life. Accustomed to seeing her mother always away from home and to finding the home itself so gloomy in her mother's absence, a girl will be incapable of feeling any taste for the austere tasks of the household; nor will she be able to understand how noble and fine they are or desire to do them when she herself is a wife and mother. . . . The working-class woman, if she thought the matter over carefully, would realise perhaps that quite often the additional money she can earn by working away from home is quickly eaten up by other expenses or by waste, which is ruinous to the family budget. If the daughter also goes out to work in a factory, business or an office, she is overwhelmed by the bustling world in which she lives, dazzled by the tinsel of a false luxury and becomes avid for loose pleasures which distract without satisfying. How then can she avoid finding her humble home more inhospitable and gloomy than it actually is?"

[1] Among other authoritative statements made at the conference in the same vein the following remarks by Professor S. Lombardini, the Economic Rapporteur, are worth quoting: "Women, too, have a right to expect society to provide conditions favourable to the development of her personality. . . . Technical progress is tending to reduce domestic work and to draw women ever more clearly into social life; it is therefore likely that the healthy inclinations which impel a woman to seek employment will steadily become more and more important." The general feeling of the conference, which reflects the broad attitude of the most thoughtful Catholic circles, is that a woman should be free to choose between work inside and outside the home. In other words, instead of being discouraged from entering the labour market, women should be encouraged to do so as long as this is likely to satisfy their needs, especially their spiritual needs; but they should be free to stay at home if their entry into the labour market would be dictated merely by material needs. Thus the ideological position is tending to shift—whereas wage-earning employment for women was at one time tolerated only if it was economically necessary, now it tends to be encouraged if it meets a spiritual and personal need, i.e. what was once a little pompously called a desire for "emancipation".

The Catholic church itself does not appear to be using its religious powers to discourage the growth of employment of women outside the home. In fact it is highly likely that forthcoming policy statements on Catholic social doctrine will endorse already widely held views.

On the whole, whatever the reasons behind it, the hitherto hostile attitude on the part of the Catholic church towards employment for women has had a marked influence in Italy on the evolution of the female labour market, whereas in the other western industrial countries the influence of religious thought on the social status of women has been very slight. In the non-Catholic countries this is because the other churches and faiths were not so openly concerned with the problem ; and in countries where Catholicism was able to exercise some influence the employment of women outside the home was already well established when official Catholic thought began to take up a definite attitude on this point. Of course in the other western industrial countries some ideological opposition to employment for women has also existed. But despite this opposition even Catholic circles have accepted the employment of women outside the home and recognised its necessity. Here we have merely set out to emphasise the possible differences between Italy and the most highly developed western industrial States, as regards the religious concept of woman's social position.

Population Policy

The second ideological factor obstructing women's employment has been the policy of population expansion. This policy, which has had far-reaching effects in many countries (and in Italy coloured the whole history of the country in the last century), was taken to extremes between the two wars, i.e. under the Fascist dictatorship. During these years it was official policy to foster and encourage the growth of the population for political ends [1] and a series of measures was taken to discourage women from working outside the home.[2] These measures were both direct,

[1] Benito Mussolini emphatically told women that they were the " guardians of the hearth ". " You must [he told them] by your tireless care and unquenchable love make the first imprint on our teeming stalwart youth. The generations of soldiers and pioneers needed to defend the Empire will be what you make them." (Speech to Fascist women on 20 June 1937 published in *Scritti e discorsi*, Vol. XI (Rome, 1938), p. 119.)

[2] It is significant, for example, that during these years in Italy there was a spate of publications on women's occupational physiology and pathology, most of which seemed to emphasise the harmful effects of employment on maternity. This tendency also fitted in quite well with the cultural and medical climate of the time in which the study of genetics was much in vogue.

e.g. statutory restrictions on the employment of women either by limiting their numbers or regulating their conditions of work [1], and indirect, e.g. a mass of family welfare legislation which was openly designed to encourage women to stay at home and have as many babies as possible instead of going out to work.[2]

The population policy of the Fascist régime—owing to the great effectiveness of " official " policies in totalitarian systems—helped to create a general climate which was more hostile to the employment of women than in any other western industrial country.

The influence of the first ideological factor referred to—the religious concept of woman's social status—has had an exceptionally good opportunity of making itself felt in Italy because after the First World War it was supported by the second factor—population policy. Before the First World War this concept had been counterbalanced by various other schools of thought which were in favour of the employment of women outside the home, e.g. the feminist movement itself, which caused a certain stir in Italy at the turn of the century, and the liberal, radical, socialist and general democratic movements, which were suffocated in the political and spiritual climate of the Fascist dictatorship but which, up to the First World War, gave Italian democracy a modern and progressive tone.[3]

---

[1] As regards limitations on numbers, the culmination of Fascist policy was the 1938 decree referred to earlier. As regards restrictions on conditions of employment, mention should be made of the laws forbidding the employment of women in certain occupations, the special regulations on hours of work and the comprehensive safeguards for expectant mothers, which are dealt with in greater detail in the following paragraph.

[2] This population policy also took the form of family allowances as part of the wage, which quite obviously fitted in with the policy of the " family wage " as it is called, especially in the Catholic countries. Italy in 1936 was one of the first countries to introduce family allowances as part of the wage and it also started a system of allowances for wives. Fascist legislation did not have any great effect because of the war but, after the war ended, the idea of the " family wage " continued to attract support in Italy as it did in some sections of opinion in Belgium and France. To this day, however, Italy is still the only country to pay an allowance to wives even though it is only quite a small one (while France has made an experiment with a complex single wage allowance). Needless to say in the English-speaking and Scandinavian countries the children's allowance is looked upon as a state welfare benefit to citizens as such and not as something forming part of the workers' wage.

[3] It would be impossible to quote the mass of literature available. Italian economic and sociological literature at the turn of the century was equal to the best European and international writing on the problem of women's employment ; in other countries this writing was instrumental in bringing about rapid progress at a time when Italy was ideologically and culturally isolated.

Institutional Factors Affecting the Evolution of the Female Labour Market

We have now examined the three main groups of factors which have slowed down the entry of women into the non-agricultural labour market in Italy. We have shown how the objective factors (economic conditions, industrial demand and unemployment) and the subjective factors (ideological influences) are fairly interdependent and in general have led to the employment of a smaller proportion of women in industry and the tertiary activities than in the major western industrial countries where employment is unrestricted. Even in the last few decades the cumulative effect in Italy of these factors has been that the employment of women in most branches of industry and the tertiary occupations has proportionately increased less than the employment of men. This is the outstanding feature of the trend in the women's labour market in Italy as compared with the other countries, namely a tendency for women to be replaced by men, whereas in the other countries the contrary has always been the case.

Moreover, these factors have been accompanied by the growth of institutions which have also affected the trend referred to. The chronic unbalance of the labour market and the ideological influences have led to the passing of legislation to protect women workers, which has ended up by restricting and discouraging their employment. This fact fits logically into the Italian pattern of labour relations in which the law has always overshadowed independent contractual action by employers' and workers' associations.

In regulating conditions of work in Italy, statute law has always prevailed over the contractual system. The weakness of the workers' associations has always led to political, i.e. legislative interference. The trade unions themselves in Italy have often given up their own prerogatives in order to achieve particular ends. The result is that collective bargaining in Italy tends to have very little prestige and time and again has had to give way to legislative action.

Another point is that collective bargaining in Italy has had a distinctive historical development. Ever since the start of collective action, but particularly as a result of the corporative form given to labour relations under Fascism, there has been a steady centralisation of collective bargaining so that, in economic and social effectiveness, it is little inferior to legislative or administrative action since it has the same binding force both in scope and in duration.

This predominance of statute law over contractual agreements in labour relations has had a definite effect on the conditions of

employment of women, which, while in most industrial countries they are settled by agreement freely concluded between employers and unions, are subject to statutory regulation in Italy.[1] The protection of working mothers is also exclusively a statutory matter.[2] The result has been a system of legal protection and safeguards which, as we have said, is one of the most comprehensive in the world. But it has also produced a situation in which conditions of employment for women are laid down without any flexibility, and this has reduced not only the negotiating power and prestige of the trade unions but also the level of employment among women. It has also convinced many employers that the employment of women is bound to involve them in undue obligations and costs—an idea which in many cases simply does not tally with the facts. In a society which for many reasons is not favourable to the employment of women, this influence has hampered their entry into productive employment. If the employers and the unions had built up their own negotiating machinery to deal with the technical, health and welfare aspects of female employment, it is likely that this alone would have led to higher employment among women.

[1] The earliest Italian legislation to protect women and children in employment was confined to questions which amply warranted statutory interference. For example the 1902 Act (and subsequent slight amendments) was limited, as regards women, to forbidding night work by young women (five years later this was forbidden for women of any age), to prohibiting underground work by women, to prescribing a fixed daily rest and a whole day off per week for women of any age and for boys up to the age of 15, and to requiring any establishment employing not less than 50 women to set aside a "special nursing room" which must be suitable and clean or, alternatively, to allow nursing mothers, in addition to the prescribed rest, to take time off to nurse their children for not less than one hour a day. The Act of 26 April 1934 regarding the protection of working women (but not of mothers), which is still in force, introduced substantial improvements in conditions of employment for women as compared with the legislation of the early part of the century ; but, by placing women in the same category as juveniles in a lengthy series of restrictions and regulations, it made the employment of women as troublesome as the employment of juveniles.

[2] The Act of 26 August 1950 further restricted the employment of women and added to its cost. In brief the Act prevents the dismissal of expectant mothers, forbids them to work during a period ranging from three to five months (depending on the type of work) ; entitles them to a daily allowance equal to 80 per cent. of earnings throughout their absence from work ; stipulates that the unavoidable absence from work must be recognised for purposes of seniority, public holidays and any other entitlements ; and requires expectant mothers to be kept on other jobs for seven months after confinement whenever their own jobs are arduous, etc. This legislation to protect working mothers has undoubtedly made employers afraid of being caught up in the tangle of protective laws by engaging women who are liable to get married. Where typically female occupations are concerned the position has already been described ; but in all cases in which it is possible to replace women by men the Act has operated as a powerful disincentive to female employment.

The Evolution of Women's Earnings

The institutional environment has had a marked influence on the way in which women's earnings—perhaps the most important as well as one of the most discussed features of their employment—are fixed in Italy.

Up to the Second World War women workers in most occupations in which they were employed, ranging from agriculture to industry and commerce, were seldom paid more than half the wages of men in corresponding and comparable jobs. Naturally the gap between men's and women's earnings for comparable jobs varied considerably; but the mass of miscellaneous data available on wages during the period between the end of the last century and the Second World War shows no significant regular pattern of differences by branch of the economy, industry or area. In 1938, for which statistics are most readily available in respect of average national earnings for each class of worker, women's earnings were around 50 per cent. of men's. In the latter years of the nineteenth century and from the beginning of the twentieth until the First World War, it would appear that the difference between men's and women's wages was in most cases even greater than in the inter-war period. Wages were at that time settled by collective agreements which were hardly ever negotiated at the national level and usually only applied to the district or the plant concerned. In many cases they could hardly be said to have been settled by collective bargaining. Moreover, the structure of industry was such that the demand for women workers was more concentrated than it now is in a small number of trades, so that women looking for work were at a greater disadvantage. During these years technical standards were also much lower and the value of the output of women in industries other than the traditionally female trades was probably lower.

Between the two wars the difference in wages between men and women tended to be around 50 per cent. Contracts having the force of law were negotiated at the national level by the Fascist corporations comprising both employers and workers. In each case the contract covered various classes of workers and a very wide geographical area, and special wage rates began to be laid down for women workers, for whom a special grading system was also introduced. This grading of male and female skills is still the rule today, for the pattern of contracts has not greatly changed.[1]

[1] In these corporative contracts women were classified in two categories (A and B) in contrast with the three or four grades for men (skilled, semi-skilled and labourers). Immediately after the war women were divided into three categories of skill in most contracts corresponding to four grades among the men; these three women's grades were simply known as grades 1, 2 and 3. For purposes of comparison it is usually agreed that the female

Women's wages were kept exceptionally low during the Fascist period as compared with men's in order to discredit the employment of women in accordance with the official policy of the time.

With the end of the Second World War and the restoration of democracy the ratio between women's and men's wages began to change. Women's wages, which in 1940 were around 50 per cent. of men's, have in recent years risen to between 75 and 80 per cent. in almost all sections of the economy. The main reason for this, however, has not been collective bargaining or government action but the currency inflation which took place in Italy immediately after the war on a scale unprecedented in the country's history.

In order to safeguard the purchasing power of wages as prices soared, a semi-official sliding scale was introduced (although it was actually contractual in origin). The wage was composed of a basic wage, i.e. the rate laid down in the contract, and allowances which varied in accordance with changes in the cost of living. As differences in wages between men and women (like those based on skill) were mainly found in the basic wage, and as the cost-of-living allowances for the two sexes were raised without any attempt to maintain the initial difference between them [1], there was an automatic levelling out of the differences in total earnings. Periodic special agreements were concluded to incorporate the cost-of-living allowance in the basic wage but, in the process, nobody had the face to restore the initial gap between men's and women's wages.[2] The campaign for equal pay thus found an unexpected ally in inflation.

Undoubtedly the fact that the agreements merging the cost-of-living allowance in the basic wage did not restore the differential was largely due to the new rights that women had acquired after the war. For the first time women were granted the right to vote in 1946. But the fact that the principle of equal pay for equal work had gained ground was due first and foremost to political and trade union campaigns. The new Republican Constitution adopted in 1947 clearly endorsed the principle even before the Equal Re-

grade 1 corresponds to the male grade 2 and so on. In other words women were in practice excluded (apart from the case of the textile industry in which a fourth grade for women has been introduced on a small scale) from the top grade of skilled workers. It is usually claimed that the differences in wages for comparable skills are even greater in fact, because the highest classes of skill are not directly comparable.

[1] The cost-of-living allowance for women was nothing like as low in relation to the men's as their basic pay. Under collective agreements signed in 1945 and 1946 in industry, the gap between women's and men's basic wages (daily workers in comparable grades) was 30 per cent. whereas for the cost-of-living allowance it was only 13 per cent.

[2] For further information see V. Foa: "Le componenti del salario femminile e il loro adeguamento alla Convenzione nº 100 del O.I.T.", report to the Conference of the Società Umanitaria 1957, published in *Retribuzione uguale per un lavoro di valore uguale* (Milan, 1958), pp. 101-118.

muneration Convention, 1951, was given force of law through its ratification by the Italian Parliament in 1956. Article 37 of the Constitution states :

> The woman worker shall have the same rights and for equal work the same remuneration as a male worker. The conditions of work shall be such as to permit her to fulfil her essential family functions and shall provide special and adequate protection for mother and child.

While sheer force of inertia would certainly have led to delay in enforcing this clause of the Constitution, it was more difficult, once women's and men's earnings had moved closer together because of the sliding scale, to restore the former differentials, which were clearly at variance with the Constitution.

Thus the present position was reached, in which women's wages are about 75 or 80 per cent. of men's in almost all branches of the economy. The gap is narrower in the more skilled occupations and wider in the less skilled. It is worth noting that the automatic closing (because of inflation) of the wage gap between men and women means that only women have managed to improve their real wages at all substantially in Italy since 1938.[1] Women, by narrowing the gap between their wages and men's, have absorbed all the extra purchasing power added by inflation to the value of wages, and they have thus been the only ones to benefit by the trade unions' policy of higher wages. Moreover this development has helped to lower the proportion of women employed in industry and

[1] The pattern is a complex one in industry and commerce. During the decade 1938-48 the real wages of workers fell nearly everywhere, whereas those of women workers rose sharply. Men's wages fell in the food industry (by 16.2 per cent.), in leather and footwear (10.4), woodworking (4.3), chemicals (4.3), engineering (6.4), wholesaling (10.6), and retailing (11.3). Men's wages during this decade rose slightly in textiles (by 7.3 per cent.), and non-metallic minerals (4.6). Women's wages, however, during the same period rose sharply in all sections of industry (ranging from a peak of 51.9 per cent. in engineering to 31.1 per cent. in chemicals) ; on the other hand their real earnings fell, though not to the same extent as men's, in wholesaling (by 9.2 per cent.) and retailing (1.2).

During the decade 1948-58 the pattern was different. Men's real wages rose slightly while women's increased more, though less sharply than in the previous decade.

The following percentage increases may be noted (the first figure in each case representing the rise in men's wages and the second that in women's) : food trades, 17.6 and 23.4 ; textiles, 3.4 and 4.0 ; leather and footwear, 7.4 and 11.9 ; woodworking, 5.7 and 12.1 ; chemicals, 7.7 and 13.8 ; non-metallic minerals, 13.3 and 18.7 ; engineering 10.3 and 15.0 ; wholesaling, 8.9 and 11.5 ; and retailing, 14.5 and 20.7. Thus during the last decade men's wages in most branches of industry have increased at an annual rate of barely 1 per cent. or perhaps a little more, whereas women's wages have constantly tended to increase at an annual rate of more than 1 per cent.

In agriculture there was a conspicuous increase in real wages during the decade 1938-48 (24.4 per cent. for men and 66.9 per cent. for women). In the following decade (1948-58) there was a very marked levelling off for both men's and women's wages (plus 0.9 per cent. and plus 0.6 per cent.). See " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit., table 30.

commerce during recent years. The rise in women's real wages (compared with the stagnation of men's), coupled with a fall in the proportion of female employment, has helped to reduce the total purchasing power of wages which would otherwise have resulted from economic developments since 1938 (if the proportion of female employment had remained unchanged).[1]

Legal and Economic Aspects of Equal Pay in Italy

In recent years the movement for equal pay has definitely gained ground and the ratification by Italy in 1956 of the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951, has unquestionably helped to keep the issue alive.

From the legal angle the position is fairly clear. Article 37 of the Italian Constitution, which prescribes equality, is generally considered to have the executive force of law and therefore to be immediately applicable without need for any further legislation. The courts themselves have many times ruled that this article is mandatory and contrary opinions are few and carry little weight. But there has been some difficulty over the interpretation of this article since the Equal Remuneration Convention was ratified. Legal experts now ask whether in fact the Convention has not qualified the absolute principle laid down in article 37 of the Constitution, since it states that the standards it prescribes should be applied through ordinary legislation or collective agreements.

There are many who argue that reference in the Convention to the possible (but not mandatory) methods by which its principles may be implemented does not alter the fact that under a legal system like the Italian the principle can be directly and immediately applied through judicial enforcement of a mandatory article of the Constitution, without there being any need for special legislation.

Others argue that, if this is so, there should be legislation authorising the labour inspectors to check on the enforcement of the principle of equal pay and laying down penalties for breaches of the law.[2]

[1] If it is assumed that the bulk of women's wages in fact form part of a family income, it could be argued that the narrowing of the gap between men's and women's wages in Italy between 1938 and 1958 and the improvement in women's real wages has not led to any improvement in the average real wage of working-class families. It is, however, arbitrary to assume that if there had been no increase in women's real wages men's real wages would have benefited thereby.

[2] New legislation on equal pay has been mainly called for by women's organisations with various leanings. For example the women's section of the Italian Workers' Christian Associations (A.C.L.I.) had a Bill submitted to Parliament in October 1958 containing clauses to secure equal pay for men and women workers. In addition to the study conference on the employ-

Yet others point to the discrepancies between the different formulas used to define the principle of parity in the Constitution, the Equal Remuneration Convention and article 119 of the Treaty instituting the European Economic Community (which has further complicated matters). The discussion naturally centres on the "objective" or "subjective" interpretation of the idea of "work". There is some doubt whether the formula "for equal work" in the Constitution can be considered to coincide with the formula "for work of equal value" used in the Convention and how it is possible to adapt this principle of the Constitution to the provisions of article 119 of the Common Market Treaty which states that equal remuneration implies "the same unit of measurement" in the case of remuneration by results and, in the case of time rates, equal remuneration for "the same job".

The legal debate on this subject has by no means ended.[1] Italy is a country with a great legal tradition and a great many, not to say too many, professors of labour law. Despite this, the interpretation of these various definitions of equality is a typical example of futile hair-splitting. Italian jurisprudence has done its utmost to define the character of this article of the Constitution but has rarely succeeded in giving any worthwhile ruling as to the value of the jobs the equality of which has been in dispute. And it is unlikely that it will ever succeed in doing so. It is extremely difficult to prove in legal terms that two jobs are identical, just as it is extremely easy to prove that they are not. This fact alone has meant that appeals to the courts on the subject of parity have been fairly few and far between, despite the existence of a complete legal apparatus for obtaining satisfaction. It is, of course, typical of wage earners, and even of the trade unions themselves, to be reluctant to go to law. This explains why many experts think it necessary to pass legislation making it the special responsibility of the labour authorities to act on behalf of the workers concerned. But, even so, could government inspectors really classify the

ment of women already referred to, another A.C.L.I. conference, held specially to discuss this problem of equal pay strongly favoured legislative action. Shortly after this conference a second draft was submitted by members of Parliament on behalf of the Union of Italian Women (U.D.I.). The U.D.I. together with many other women's organisations took part in the 1957 conference organised by the Società Umanitaria referred to earlier. The concensus of opinion at this conference was also that legislation was called for.

[1] See the papers submitted by P. BASILE, U. TERRACINI and D. RIZZO, the speeches by U. PROSPERETTI and U. NATOLI, together with the reports of Ada PICCIOTTO and M. Luisa ZAVATTARO ARDIZZI to the Conference of the Società Umanitaria referred to earlier in its record of proceedings, *Retribuzione uguale per un lavoro di valore uguale*, op. cit. See also A. VENTURI: "Il principio 'a lavoro uguale, salario uguale' nella legislazione comparata", in *Il diritto del lavoro*, 1950.

extraordinary variety of jobs in which men and women are engaged in actual life in every single factory ?

In point of fact, whatever legal interpretation may be made of this formula, the principle of equality is clearly recognised.[1] The problem is to translate this principle into changed wage rates. In other words it is not legal so much as technical and contractual.

But in Italy this widely recognised principle of equality comes up against an unsuitable contractual system. When we discussed the differences between men's and women's wages we spoke of the grades for " comparable " rather than " identical " jobs. In other words, where the simple grades of the national collective agreements are concerned (apart altogether from the variety of separate jobs covered by these grades) it is not possible to speak of strictly equal work. This is what makes some commentators support the view, which is widespread in employers' circles, that in agreements women should be dealt with separately from men and the three grades for women should be given a different definition and meaning from the four men's grades ; on this view there would be no contractual equality of work on which a claim for contractual equality of payment could be based. In actual fact the very existence of " female " grades is an employment discrimination based on sex and this is at variance—where it is not inherent in the job itself—with the principle of equality. The employers themselves have, however, realised for some time that their argument that the distinction between the sexes for contractual grading purposes is compatible with the principle of equality, cannot be upheld. Nowadays they are trying, in conjunction with the unions, to find the least burdensome method of changing the wording of collective agreements to bring them into line with the principle of equality by eliminating any specific reference to grades for women workers.[2]

But does this mean that " equal remuneration " will be paid for " equal work " ? Clearly no, because the " grade " is only one

[1] Strong support for strengthening the principle has been manifested in Italian legal circles. See, for example, the article by a judge, E. PEDRONI : " La donna nei rapporti di lavoro " in *Studi in onore d'Ernesto Eula*, Vol. III, pp. 175-191, which also demonstrates a modern approach to the old question of the employment of women ; see also DE LUCA TAMAIO : " La donna nell'ordinamento giuridico del lavoro ", in *Rivista giuridica del lavoro*, 1956.

[2] In addition to the normal negotiations on national agreements for the main categories, during which the problem of wage parity has cropped up, the Italian General Confederation of Industry (the employers' organisation) set up, in conjunction with the unions, an Inter-Confederal Technical Committee in 1958 to " settle the question of the remuneration of male and female skills together with the regulations pertaining thereto ". The Committee ended its work at the beginning of 1959 and produced a report which constitutes an up-to-date review of the wage differentials in force in industry. The results of this survey (for which see table 32 of " Alcune fonti statistiche ", op. cit.) are now being bargained over.

factor and not the most important in any assessment of the work; the most important feature today is analysis of the job itself and its objective characteristics.

Parity of wages for the contractual grades can give no worthwhile safeguards that women will have the same grades as men for similar jobs. It is important to say " similar " and not " identical " because, where jobs are concerned, differentiation is virtually unlimited and classification is almost impossible.

Parity in practice can only be achieved through job analysis and only on the factory floor itself. Not only is the law incapable of finding a formula for assessing the " work " actually involved in a job but it is an artificial obstacle in the way of job analysis.

Once common grades for men and women have been laid down by law, subsequent wage adjustments must take them into account and so remain confined within the statutory grading system. The Italian contractual system therefore has nothing to gain from legislation condemning discrimination based on sex; this is a matter easily dealt with by contractual means; moreover it would be severely hampered by any legal provisions designed to equalise wages at the factory level, where the problem can be tackled only by collective bargaining.

Indeed the best way of improving a contractual system is surely to negotiate collective agreements.[1]

There are many reasons why the unions need to defend their own interests in the matter of women's wages. In the first place they would certainly lose no prestige among their women members and would keep the normal bargaining machinery in their own hands. Secondly, it is the unions that can make a reality of the principle of equal remuneration, which can be given meaning only by the direct comparison of jobs on the factory floor and not merely by allotting the workers to arbitrarily established grades. Thirdly, by getting as close as possible to true equality in the value of the work, they would ensure (and would therefore be able to guarantee to the employers) that the principle of equality would not in fact conceal disparities in output, i.e. would not discourage the employment of women. Fourthly, to take account of the possible reluctance of employers to pay women the same remuneration as men even though their productivity is the same, the unions would be in a position to adapt their action to the situation, confining themselves, where it is unfavourable, to attacking the arbitrary

[1] The Equal Remuneration Convention explicitly states (Article 2) that the principle of parity " may be applied by means of—*(a)* national laws or regulations; *(b)* legally established or recognised machinery for wage determination; *(c)* collective agreements between employers and workers; or *(d)* a combination of these various means ".

classification of women in special grades, which, as was stated earlier, is in any case incompatible with the legal principle of equality. In other words, the contractual instrument would be flexible enough in the hands of the unions and would also have the advantage of strengthening their prestige and power.

In Italy, however, there are serious obstacles in the way of a development along these lines. These are : (1) the weakness of the trade union movement ; (2) its immaturity ; (3) the backwardness of personnel administration in industry ; and (4) unwillingness to increase the employment of women. These obstacles link up with a number of the points made in earlier sections.

For example the trade unions' weakness means that there is little prospect of effective collective agreements at the plant level on the analysis and evaluation of men's and women's jobs. The immaturity of the trade unions also helps to explain their weakness. The whole Italian trade union tradition, as was mentioned earlier, is to look for salvation from statutory action. Many Italian trade union leaders concentrate on creating the " political conditions " in which trade union aims can be secured by legislative means. The result is that the unions do not feel that there has been any infringement of their functions or prerogatives whenever the Government or Parliament takes the initiative in regulating labour relations.[1]

As regards the prospect of a new enactment to enforce wage parity, the Italian Confederation of Workers' Unions, one of the two trade union organisations which represent the great bulk of workers [2], has recently come out against the idea and has made the achievement of wage parity through contractual action one of its main aims. The other organisation, the Italian General Confederation of Labour, however, has been a staunch supporter of further statutory action, e.g. the Bill submitted on behalf of the Union of Italian Women.[3]

The backwardness of personnel techniques in industry certainly does not help the growth of labour-management relations or consequently of female employment. The fact is that most managements look upon the unions as more of a hindrance than a help and quite often Italian employers prefer to incur obligations and liabil-

[1] It should not be forgotten that the leaders of the Italian trade union organisations take an active part in Parliament as representatives of political parties. Some of them have even taken government office. There is no incompatibility in Italy between trade union and parliamentary responsibilities.

[2] The Italian Confederation of Workers' Unions is affiliated to the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions while the Italian General Confederation of Labour belongs to the World Federation of Trade Unions.

[3] To understand the outlook and policy which predominate in the Italian General Confederation of Labour see Inès PISONI-CERLESI : *La parità di salario in Italia* (Rome, Editrice " Lavoro ", 1959).

ities—and therefore higher costs—rather than establish good relations with the unions. Even modern job analysis and evaluation techniques (like wage techniques in general) have made little progress in Italian industry. This is not a question of ill will so much as of incompetence. The objective appraisal of jobs which the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951, requires governments to encourage (Article 3) is still quite beyond the grasp of a large section of Italian employers. Italian management still thinks in terms of the old legal and contractual system of personal qualifications, and it fights against the idea that it is possible to negotiate earnings and fix differentials in relation to the job itself. Greater development of job evaluation techniques (of course without any differentiation between men and women) would be the best way out of this awkward problem of parity.

Not the least important obstacle to the contractual achievement of parity is the lukewarm interest taken by unions, employers, politicians and the Government in the maintenance and extension of employment among women. All the legislation to protect working women and mothers, and even the draft legislation to implement parity, appears to bear out the suspicion that in many quarters a fall in the level of employment among women would not cause dismay. The Ministry of Labour has not apparently grasped the full importance of the problems of women's employment and has not even set up a small department to deal with them.

Despite these serious obstacles, however, the equalisation of wages is making progress. It is unlikely that legislation will be passed to implement the constitutional principle, especially in view of the opposition of the Confederation of Italian Workers' Unions. Contractually, however, some progress is certain to be made under force of circumstances, and it is likely that the anomaly of discrimination in grading based on sex will disappear. The process will be a slow one but it is inevitable. There is greater ground for concern over the prospect of basing men's and women's wages on the results of job analysis. Satisfactory changes in this respect would require a dynamic approach which seems unlikely in the Italian industry of today. It would also make demands on the technical and organising abilities of the trade unions—a hopeless prospect as long as the labour movement is divided and spends its energies in the political arena.

Conclusions and Future Trends

The main purpose of this article on recent trends in the employment of women in Italy has been to bring out the distinctive features of the female labour market compared with the " typical " trend in women's employment in a modern industrial society.

Without making any explicit reference to it, we have all along borne in mind the trend in women's employment in the other western industrial countries, which has certain common features that we have assumed to be representative of this "typical" trend. What is the outlook for the employment of women ? This is not only a rash question but a complicated one, and it is so tied up with a number of other complex issues of our age that we have taken care to leave this aspect out of consideration, even as background. We have merely set out to examine and trace the trend in women's employment in Italy in the light of the trend in other countries.

The most obvious difference, as we have pointed out, is that the number of women coming on the labour market has been proportionately lower than in the "typical" western countries. These obstacles in the way of women's employment have been related to the general tendency in the past few decades for men to take the place of women workers—exactly the opposite of what has happened in the other countries.

The main part of the article then illustrates and assesses this phenomenon and links it up with the factors that have caused and accompanied it. Once this major point has been disposed of, the question arises : What are the future prospects of employment for women in Italy in view of the developments we have discussed ? Are these trends likely to persist in the future ? Will the obstacles in the way of the employment of women remain equally serious ? Will the proportion of Italian women wage earners in the labour force continue to decline in both industry and the tertiary occupations ? There are simply not enough facts available to be able to answer these questions. One can only give impressions, which in many cases are far too personal. The writer, living in Italy and with first-hand knowledge of Italian society, has the general impression that the trend in female employment will soon show a marked change. The pattern of Italian society in recent years has altered to quite a considerable extent. So far the indices of economic development are still somewhat contradictory. While output per head is rising satisfactorily, there has not been sufficient improvement in the level of employment or the distribution of income, and a number of basic economic problems have still not been tackled. But in some ways Italian society in the past few years has undergone a major change, especially in its economic aspects. There has been a very large-scale drift from the land, coupled with substantial expansion in the tertiary occupations and—perhaps to not quite the same extent—in the wage-earning sector.[1]

[1] As we have seen, the wage-earning system has developed as the population has moved to the towns. Merely during the years 1954-58 the percentage of wage earners rose from 55.1 to 59.3 per cent. while the share of

These changes in the economy have not yet had their impact on the female labour market. In the last few years the employment figures have followed the trend of the past decades. But it is very likely that economic and social development has had, first of all, to offset the forces hitherto working against women's employment, particularly between the two wars. This development still has a little way to go before it begins to affect the female labour market.

There is another factor which strengthens this impression and that is the behaviour and outlook of the young Italian women of today. Anyone who has lived in Italy in recent years must have noticed the marked change in the general attitudes of Italian girls—changes which seem to be taking place almost under our eyes. In all social classes, among town dwellers and peasants, rich and poor, in industry, in offices and even in the villages, values are changing and knowingly or unknowingly the Italian woman is helping to bring the change about. The process can be detected in changes in fashion, in women's magazines, in family life and in girls' moral standards ; there is a tendency to consider all this merely as a vogue and it is admittedly hard to find any statistical measurement of it. But young women are becoming increasingly enterprising and more and more painstaking over their persons and their behaviour. The way they walk and talk, the increasing use they make of cosmetics, the growing number of women who drive cars or who have bank accounts, the tendency for youth to last longer and the precocity and confidence of the girls of today, together with many other features of Italian social life in recent years, especially in the big towns, certainly do not suggest that women will any longer be content with household chores. The feature which all these characteristics have in common is a greater assertion of women's personality and willpower. Italian women seem determined in every way—at home or at work, in their opinions and in their behaviour—to achieve greater independence.

These impressions, it must be repeated, are not yet borne out by any increase in the number of women in employment. But there can be no doubt that they are the best answer to the many questions which arise over the future trend in the Italian female labour market.

---

labour in the national income rose from 50 per cent. in 1951 to 55.9 per cent. in 1957 although with substantial variations during these six years (these official figures come from a survey *Reddito, occupazione, produttività e salari dal 1953 al 1958*, published under the auspices of the Research Department of the Italian Confederation of Workers' Unions (Rome, 1959), which should also be consulted for more recent information).